Comparative analysis of two algicidal bacteria active against the red tide dinoflagellate *Karenia brevis*

Patricia B. Roth a,b, Michael J. Twiner a, Christina M. Mikulski a, Amanda B. Barnhorst a, Gregory J. Doucette a,*

a Marine Biotoxins Program, NOAA/National Ocean Service, 219 Fort Johnson Road, Charleston, SC 29412, USA
b Graduate Program in Marine Biology, College of Charleston, Grice Marine Biological Laboratory, Charleston, SC 29412, USA

Received 2 October 2007; received in revised form 6 February 2008; accepted 7 February 2008

Abstract

The red tide dinoflagellate *Karenia brevis* blooms annually along the eastern Gulf of Mexico, USA, and is often linked to significant economic losses through massive fish kills, shellfish harvest closures, and the potential threat to humans of neurotoxic shellfish poisonings as well as exposure to aerosolized toxin. As part of an effort to enhance the strategies employed to manage and mitigate these events and their adverse effects, several approaches are being investigated for controlling blooms. Previous studies have established the presence of algicidal bacteria lethal to *K. brevis* in these waters, and we aim to characterize bacterial–algal interactions, evaluate their role as natural regulators of *K. brevis* blooms, and ultimately assess possible management applications. Herein, the algicidal activity of a newly isolated *Cytophaga/Flavobacterium/Bacteroidetes* (CFB)-bacterium, strain S03, and a previously described CFB-bacterium, strain 41-DBG2, was evaluated against various harmful algal bloom (HAB) and non-HAB species (23 total), including multiple clones of *K. brevis*, to evaluate algal target specificity. Strains S03 and 41-DBG2, which employ direct and indirect modes of algicidal lysis, respectively, killed ~20% and ~40% of the bacteria-containing isolates tested. Interestingly, no bacteria-free algal cultures were resistant to algicidal attack, whereas susceptibility varied occasionally among bacteria-containing isolates of a single algal taxon originating from either the same or different geographic location. The dynamics of *K. brevis* culture death appeared to differ according to whether the algicidal bacterium did or did not require direct contact with algal cells, with the former most rapidly affecting *K. brevis* morphology and causing cell lysis. Both bacterial strains promoted the formation of a small number of cyst-like structures in the *K. brevis* cultures, possibly analogous to temporary cysts formed by other dinoflagellates exposed to certain types of stress. Results were also consistent with earlier work demonstrating that bacterial assemblages from certain cultures can confer resistance to attack by algicidal bacteria, again indicating the complexity and importance of microbial interactions, and the need to consider carefully the potential for using such bacteria in management activities.

Keywords: Algicidal bacteria; Cyst formation; *Cytophaga*; Dinoflagellate; *Flavobacteriaceae*; Harmful algal bloom; *Karenia brevis*

1. Introduction

The athecate dinoflagellate *Karenia brevis* (formerly *Gymnodinium breve*; Davis, 1948) G. Hansen and Moestrup is a harmful species often associated with massive fish and marine mammal mortality events in the Gulf of Mexico (Steidinger et al., 1998). As a result, upwards of millions of dollars are lost by the recreation and tourism industries during years with *K. brevis* red tide events (Anderson et al., 2001). In an effort to manage and mitigate the potentially devastating effects of these and other types of harmful algal blooms (HABs), several control strategies such as chemical algicides, flocculants and other physical manipulations, as well as biological agents, are currently under investigation (Hennes et al., 1995; Doucette et al., 1999; Anderson et al., 2001; Sengco et al., 2001; Kim, 2006). In marine and freshwater ecosystems, biological agents such as bacteria, viruses, protozoans, and fungi have all shown promise as potential algal bloom suppressors (Imai et al., 1998; Doucette et al., 1999; Castberg et al., 2001; Manage et al., 2001; Kang et al., 2005).

Bacteria have significant impacts on aquatic biogeochemical processes such as carbon flux and nutrient regeneration (Azam, 1998; Doucette et al., 1998; Copley, 2002). These microbes are known to be active in the decomposition of freshwater algal blooms (Kang et al., 2005) and may play a similar role in marine systems by influencing the initiation, growth, main-
Algalicidal bacteria are classified according to their mode of lysis, which can be either direct or indirect (see reviews by Mayali and Azam, 2004; Salomon and Imai, 2006). The former requires that a bacterium be in direct contact with the target algal species and lysis is thought to result from enzymatic digestion of the algal cell wall/membrane (e.g., Lee et al., 2000). Alternatively, algalicidal bacteria exhibiting an indirect killing mechanism release a dissolved lytic agent(s) effective in the absence of physical contact with the target. Based on several recent reviews (Fukuyo et al., 2002; Mayali and Azam, 2004; Hare et al., 2005), at least 56 unique algalicidal bacteria have been isolated and classified phylogenetically. Of these, 36 strains were characterized according to their lytic mechanism, with approximately 70% showing an indirect mode of attack and the remaining 30% requiring direct contact with the algal cells. Although the functional significance of cell lysis by algalicidal bacteria remains to be determined, this activity clearly enhances the supply of algal-derived organic nutrients that may then provide a competitive advantage to this segment of the microbial community (Doucette, 1995; Mayali and Azam, 2004).

Most algalicidal bacteria characterized thus far belong to the Cytophagaceae/Flavobacteriaceae/Bacteroidetes group (Fandino et al., 2001; Yoshinaga et al., 1995) or to the γ-Proteobacteria group (Imai et al., 1995; Yoshinaga et al., 1995). Of the 56 algalicidal strains noted above, about 50% belong to the CFB group while about 45% are members of the γ-Proteobacteria, with the remaining strains representing the gram-positive genera Micrococcus, Bacillus, and Planomicrobiurn. Although there is no conclusive link between phylogeny and the lytic mechanism, the available data suggest that gram-positive bacteria and γ-Proteobacteria employ primarily an indirect mode of attack, while the lytic activity of the CFB group can involve either direct or indirect interactions with target cells.

Considering the overall size of the CFB group, relatively few species are actually algalicidal and the mode of attack does not appear to be consistent within or between the various genera. Doucette et al. (1999) isolated an algalicidal Cytophaga sp., strain 41-DBG2, capable of killing K. brevis via the production of a soluble, heat-sensitive, algalicidal compound (Twiner et al., 2004), yet a closely related Cytophaga sp., strain J18/M01, lyases the raphidophyte Chattonella antiqua by direct attack (Imai et al., 1993). Alternatively, Aquimarina latercula (formerly Cytophaga latercula; Nedashkovskaya et al., 2006), another marine bacterium within the CFB group, exhibits no algalicidal activity and has been used as a negative control in many of our studies.

In this paper, we report the isolation of a new algalicidal bacterium belonging to the family Flavobacteriaceae (strain S03; GenBank accession no. EU021292) from the Gulf of Mexico and compare its direct mode of algalicidal attack with the indirect activity of Cytophaga sp. (strain 41-DBG2; GenBank accession no. AF427479) using K. brevis isolates determined previously to be susceptible or resistant to these algalicidal bacteria. We also assess the effects of exposure to such bacteria on the morphology, growth characteristics, and bacterial succession patterns in the K. brevis cultures. The data obtained from this investigation will improve our understanding of the complex interactions between algalicidal bacteria and their target algal species, as well as aid in evaluating the possible use of algalicidal bacteria as part of a HAB management strategy.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Field collections

Water samples were collected from the west Florida shelf in 2001 during the ECOHAB RV Suncoaster cruises (September 20–26; October 20–26). At most stations whole water samples were obtained from three depths, corresponding to surface, middle (mid-water column), and bottom (approximately 1 m from the bottom); occasionally, surface samples were also collected from a continuous flow-through system maintained on the ship’s deck. All samples were pre-filtered through 80 μm nitex screen and three aliquots of the <80 μm filtrate containing both attached and free-living bacteria were amended with glycerol (10% final concentration) and stored in liquid nitrogen. These ‘freeze-downs’ were transported to the laboratory and used to screen for algalicidal activity as outlined below.

2.2. Culture conditions and monitoring of growth

A non-axenic (i.e., bacteria-containing) K. brevis clonal isolate from Charlotte Harbor, FL, USA (isolate C2; provided by Dr. K. Steidinger, Fish and Wildlife Research Institute, St. Petersburg, FL, USA) was used for the initial screenings of algalicidal activity and bacterial isolations. Additional studies employed the non-axenic K. brevis clonal isolate NOAA-1 and a K. mikimotoi isolate G303ax2 from Suo Nada, Japan (provided, respectively, by Dr. S. Morton, National Ocean Service/CCEHBR, Charleston, SC, USA and Dr. K. Fukami, Kochi University, Japan). The latter isolate was selected based on its phylogenetic similarity to K. brevis and its bacteria-free status as demonstrated by both direct microscopic observations and PCR-based methods (Mayali and Doucette, 2002). All algal cultures used in this study were grown in 25 mL of f/2 medium without silicate (Guillard, 1975) at 20 °C on a 16 h:8 h L: D regime with a photon flux rate of ~75 μmol m⁻² s⁻¹ (model QSL 100; Biospherical Instruments, San Diego, CA, USA).
In vivo fluorescence was monitored every 48 h (unless otherwise specified) using a Turner Designs model 10-AU fluorometer (optical kit 10-040R; Sunnyvale, CA, USA) and used as a proxy for algal growth. A culture was considered to be dead when relative fluorescence units (RFUs) declined below 10% of the controls.

2.3. Screening for algicidal activity and isolation of algicidal bacteria

Frozen whole water samples (<80 μm fraction) were thawed, washed twice with sterile 0.22 μm-filtered seawater to remove excess glycerol, and aliquots (100 and 200 μL) added to exponentially growing K. brevis C2 cultures. A negative control of sterile seawater (200 μL) and a positive control containing 10^5 cells mL^-1 of a known algicidal bacterium (strain 41-DBG2) were tested concurrently. When the RFUs declined to below 10% of the negative control, 200 μL from these freshly killed cultures were added to a new exponentially growing K. brevis culture. This process, designed to enrich for algicidal bacteria prior to isolation attempts, was repeated until death of K. brevis consistently occurred within 4 days of inoculation.

For isolation of algicidal bacterium S03, samples taken directly from killed K. brevis C2 cultures were streaked onto agar plates of either dinoflagellate bacterial growth medium (DBG/5; Doucette et al., 1999) or seawater complete medium agar plates of either dinoflagellate bacterial growth medium control containing 10^3 cells mL^-1. Half of the cultures (treatment, n = 4) or strain 41-DBG2 at 10^5 cells mL^-1 (n = 2) and monitored for 10 days. Previous studies showed that these concentrations of the respective bacteria elicited culture death within 4 days of inoculation, thereby providing a more closely comparable time course. Negative controls were treated with an equivalent volume of sterile seawater.

2.4. DNA extraction and 16S rDNA sequencing

Bacterial genomic DNA was extracted using a standard CTAB (hexadecyltrimethyl ammonium bromide) protocol with the modifications described in Mayali and Doucette (2002). The 16S rDNA was amplified using the universal prokaryotic primer 27f and the Eu-bacteria-specific primer 1492r (Long and Azam, 2001) under the following conditions: 20 mM Tris–HCl (pH 8.4), 50 mM KCl, 2.5 mM MgCl₂, 0.2 mM each dNTP, 0.5 μM each primer, and 2.5 units Taq polymerase (Invitrogen; Grand Island, NY, USA). An initial denaturing step of 5 min at 92 °C was followed by 30 cycles of denaturing (92 °C), annealing (45 °C), and extension (72 °C) each for 45 s. A final extension at 72 °C ran for 7 min. Direct sequencing of purified amplicons was performed by SeqWright DNA Technology Services (Houston, TX, USA) on an ABI Prism™ 3730xl sequencer (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA). Multiple internal primers (Lane, 1991) were employed to ensure that all regions were sequenced redundantly in both directions. A BLAST sequence similarity search was run on the consensus sequence in GenBank (Altschul et al., 1990; www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov).

2.5. Strain S03 concentration-dependent algicidal activity

Pure isolates of algicidal strain S03 were grown in SWC broth, washed, enumerated, and added to bacteria-free K. mikimotoi cultures at concentrations (final) ranging from 10^2 to 10^6 cells mL^-1. Triplicate K. mikimotoi cultures were inoculated on Day 1 and monitored every 48 h via in vivo fluorescence. A negative control of sterile seawater was added at a volume equivalent to the 10^5 S03 cells mL^-1 treatment. A culture was considered killed when the RFUs declined to <10% of the negative control.

2.6. Screening algal isolates for resistance/susceptibility to algicidal activity

To assess the degree of taxonomic specificity for algicidal strains S03 and 41-DBG2, six dinoflagellate species (not including Karenia spp.), two diatoms, and one raphidophyte were screened against one or both bacteria (Table 1). Ten strains of K. brevis and four strains of K. mikimotoi were also tested. Exponentially growing cultures were treated with strain S03 at 10^5 cells mL^-1 (n = 5) or strain 41-DBG2 at 10^6 cells mL^-1 (n = 2) and monitored for 10 days. Previous studies showed that these concentrations of the respective bacteria elicited culture death within 4 days of inoculation, thereby providing a more closely comparable time course. Negative controls were treated with an equivalent volume of sterile seawater.

2.7. Determination of algicidal mechanism

The mode of algicidal attack for strain S03 was examined by inoculating 25 mL cultures of K. brevis C2 with this bacterium (10^5 cells mL^-1, n = 4). Additional K. brevis C2 cultures were treated with an equal volume of sterile seawater and served as controls (n = 4). Once algal cell lysis occurred in the C2/S03 co-culture replicates, each was passed sequentially through 5 μm polycarbonate and 0.22 μm cellulose acetate filters. The collected filtrate was then amended with f/2 nutrients and used as the growth medium for bacteria-free K. mikimotoi cultures. Half of the K. mikimotoi cultures (treatment, n = 2) were inoculated with strain S03 (10^5 cells mL^-1), while the remaining cultures received sterile seawater (control, n = 2). The in vivo fluorescence of all cultures (n = 2) was monitored every 48 h for 10 days.

2.8. Comparative time course of algicidal effects

To compare the effects of strains S03 and 41-DBG2 on two clonal K. brevis isolates (C2 and NOAA-1) culture growth, algal morphology, and changes in the microbial community were monitored periodically over a 7-day time course (Days 1, 2, 3, 5, and 7). Treatment with a closely related, non-algicidal bacterium, A. laticolor, was included as a negative control. All bacteria were added at a concentration of 10^5 cells mL^-1 for comparability. An ANOVA was performed in the JMP statistical package (ver. 6; SAS, Cary, NC, USA) and, when necessary, the a posteriori Tukey’s honestly significant
difference (HSD) test was used to identify which treatments were significantly different. At designated time points, samples from each treatment were fixed with 10% formalin, examined on an Axiovert S100 epifluorescence microscope (Zeiss, Inc., Thornwood, NY, USA), and photographed with a Spot digital camera (model 1.4.0, Diagnostic Instruments, Inc., Sterling Heights, MI, USA). Genomic DNA was extracted from each treatment, amplified, and analyzed for bacterial community structure using the following DGGE protocol. The 16S rRNA gene was amplified using primers 341f, with a 32-base GC clamp at the 5' end, and 517r (Muyzer et al., 1993). The PCR reaction components and conditions were as described previously by Mayali and Doucette (2002). Eight percent polyacrylamide gels (37:1 acrylamide:bisacrylamide) were prepared with a denaturing gradient of 35–60% (100%: 7 M urea and 40% v/v deionized formamide) and DNA concentrations in all wells were normalized. Gels ran for 16 h at 70 V/60 °C in a BIORAD D-code system (Hercules, CA, USA) containing 0.5× TAE buffer and were stained with SYBR® Gold (Invitrogen-Molecular Probes, Eugene, OR, USA) upon completion. Gels were imaged using a FluorChem™ 8900 Imaging System (Alpha Innotech, San Leandro, CA, USA) using a SYBR Green/Gold photographic filter and analyzed with dedicated AlphaEase FC software (ver. 4.0).

3. Results

3.1. Isolation of algicidal bacterium strain S03

The initial screening of surface water sample #131 (28° 27.3′ N/83° 13.1′ W) exhibited putative algicidal activity against *K. brevis* C2; over the course of three consecutive enrichments, culture death was achieved in 4 days versus the initial 25 days. Samples from the last enrichment were plated on SWC agar and a purified colony, herein referred to as strain S03, tested positive for algicidal activity. The same algicidal bacterium, based on 16S rDNA sequencedata (see below), was also isolated independently from a second spatio-temporally distinct, whole water sample.

Table 1

**Susceptibility of various algal species to lysis by the algicidal bacteria strains S03 and 41-DBG2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Isolate</th>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>Bacteria-free</th>
<th>S03</th>
<th>41-DBG2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia</em> spp.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>B4</td>
<td>Piney Island, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>B5</td>
<td>Corpus Christi, TX, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>C2</td>
<td>Charlotte Harbor, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>C2</td>
<td>Charlotte Harbor, FL, USA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>C5</td>
<td>Mexico Beach, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>NOAA-1</td>
<td>Charlotte Harbor, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>NOAA-1</td>
<td>Charlotte Harbor, FL, USA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>PS3</td>
<td>Pensacola, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia brevis</em></td>
<td>Wilson</td>
<td>Tampa, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia mikimotoi</em></td>
<td>CCMP 429</td>
<td>Plymouth, England</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia mikimotoi</em></td>
<td>NOAA-2</td>
<td>Sarasota, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia mikimotoi</em></td>
<td>1651</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karenia mikimotoi</em></td>
<td>G303xx-2</td>
<td>Suo Nada, Japan</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other dinoflagellates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Akashiwo sanguinea</em></td>
<td>95003</td>
<td>Florida Bay, FL, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alexandrium tamarense</em></td>
<td>OK905-5</td>
<td>Okkirai Bay, Japan</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alexandrium tamarense</em></td>
<td>AITE-10</td>
<td>Fal Estuary, England</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alexandrium monilatum</em></td>
<td>AM01</td>
<td>Gulf Port, MS, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alexandrium monilatum</em></td>
<td>AM06</td>
<td>Gulf Port, MS, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alexandrium fundyense</em></td>
<td>GTCA 29</td>
<td>Gulf of Maine, NH, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Gymnodinium catenatum</em></td>
<td>SE-GC</td>
<td>Senzaki Bay, Japan</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Gymnodinium simplex</em></td>
<td>CCMP 420</td>
<td>Gulf of Tehuan teppec, Mexico</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diatoms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Pseudo-nitzschia multiseries</em></td>
<td>CCMP 1660</td>
<td>Prince Edward Is., Canada</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Skeletonea costatum</em></td>
<td>CCMP 1332</td>
<td>Milford, CT, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raphidophyte</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Heterosigma akashiwo</em></td>
<td>CCMP 1870</td>
<td>Long Beach, CA, USA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Starting bacterial concentrations were 10⁵ cells mL⁻¹; algal growth (*in vivo* fluorescence) was monitored for 10 days after inoculation of the bacteria.

*Algal isolates are denoted as susceptible (S), resistant (R), or not tested (–).*
S03 exhibited a 95% sequence similarity to a previously characterized algicidal bacterium, *Flavobacterium* sp. strain 5N-3 (GenBank accession no. AB017597), Mayali (2001) classified strain 41-DBG2 (GenBank accession no. AF427479) as a member of the CFB complex, sharing a close taxonomic relationship with six other algicidal bacteria and one non-algicidal bacterium, *A. latercula* (formerly *C. latercula*); however, based on recent submissions to GenBank, strain 41-DBG2 is now most similar to the bacterium LPK13 (*Flavobacteriaceae*; GenBank accession no. EF527872) (95% maximum identity; 100% query coverage). The next closest matches (all 94% similarity) included three unidentified members of the phylum Bacteroidetes, as well as the recently named *Dokdonia donghaensis* (Yoon et al., 2005), *Krokinobacter genikus*, *K. diaferikos*, and *K. eikastus* (Khan et al., 2006), all belonging to newly described genera.

3.3. Strain S03 concentration-dependent effect on *Karenia mikimotoi*

A concentration-dependent relationship was observed when increasing levels of strain S03 were added to bacteria-free cultures of *K. mikimotoi* (G303ax-2) on Day 0 (Fig. 1). By Day 2, a decrease in *in vivo* fluorescence was observed for all bacterial additions, with the relative rates of decline generally proportional to the strain S03 concentration. On Day 4 all treatments exhibited a fluorescence signal less than 10% of the negative control indicating culture death.

3.4. Resistance/susceptibility of algal isolates to algicidal activity

As many as 23 algal isolates were exposed to bacterial strains S03 and 41-DBG2 to determine their susceptibility to algicidal attack; several *K. brevis* isolates as well as other HAB and non-HAB species, including species of *Akashiwo*, *Alexandrium*, *Gymnodinium*, *Heterosigma*, *Pseudo-nitzschia*, and *Skeletonema*, were screened (Table 1). No bacteria-free isolates (*Karenia* spp. only) were resistant to algicidal attack, whereas *K. brevis* C2 was the only bacteria-containing *Karenia* isolate susceptible to both strains S03 and 41-DBG2. Considering only the bacteria-containing algal isolates, strain S03 killed 4 of 18 isolates tested (22%), whereas strain 41-DBG2 was effective against 9 of 23 isolates (39%). All five of the isolates susceptible to S03 were also killed by 41-DBG2. Nevertheless, *Alexandrium tamarense* ATFE-10 and *Alexandrium monilatum* AM06 were susceptible only to attack by strain 41-DBG2, yet *A. monilatum* AM01 was resistant to both algicidal strains. In addition, *A. tamarense* OK905-5 (origin—Japan) was killed by both strains S03 and 41-DBG2, unlike *A. tamarense* ATFE-10 (origin—England).

3.5. Algicidal mechanism of strain S03

To determine whether algicidal bacterium S03 employs a direct or indirect mechanism of attack, *K. brevis* C2 cultures were grown in the presence (10³ cells mL⁻¹; treatment) and absence (control) of strain S03 (n = 4). Immediately following lysis of the C2/S03 co-cultures on Day 4 (Fig. 2), filtrates from both treatment and control cultures were re-amended with f/2 nutrients and inoculated with bacteria-free *K. mikimotoi* (n = 2) on Day 5. The growth of both control and treatment cultures was not significantly different (p = 0.144; Fig. 2).

3.6. Comparative effects of strains S03 and 41-DBG2 on *Karenia brevis*

The effects of algicidal bacteria strains S03 and 41-DBG2, and the non-algicidal bacterium *A. latercula*, were examined on *K. brevis* isolates C2 (susceptible; Table 1) and NOAA-1 (resistant; Table 1). Cultures of *K. brevis* C2 inoculated with strain S03 or 41-DBG2 (both 10⁵ cells mL⁻¹) were lysed by Day 3 and Day 7, respectively (Fig. 3A). According to an ANOVA and an a posteriori Tukey’s HSD test, the response of cultures treated with either of the algicidal bacteria differed significantly from those receiving *A. latercula* (p = 0.0009). *K. brevis* C2 was the only bacteria-containing *Karenia* isolate susceptible to both strains S03 and 41-DBG2. Considering only the bacteria-containing algal isolates, strain S03 killed 4 of 18 isolates tested (22%), whereas strain 41-DBG2 was effective against 9 of 23 isolates (39%). All five of the isolates susceptible to S03 were also killed by 41-DBG2. Nevertheless, *Alexandrium tamarense* ATFE-10 and *Alexandrium monilatum* AM06 were susceptible only to attack by strain 41-DBG2, yet *A. monilatum* AM01 was resistant to both algicidal strains. In addition, *A. tamarense* OK905-5 (origin—Japan) was killed by both strains S03 and 41-DBG2, unlike *A. tamarense* ATFE-10 (origin—England).

3.5. Algicidal mechanism of strain S03

To determine whether algicidal bacterium S03 employs a direct or indirect mechanism of attack, *K. brevis* C2 cultures were grown in the presence (10³ cells mL⁻¹; treatment) and absence (control) of strain S03 (n = 4). Immediately following lysis of the C2/S03 co-cultures on Day 4 (Fig. 2), filtrates from both treatment and control cultures were re-amended with f/2 nutrients and inoculated with bacteria-free *K. mikimotoi* (n = 2) on Day 5. The growth of both control and treatment cultures was not significantly different (p = 0.144; Fig. 2).

3.6. Comparative effects of strains S03 and 41-DBG2 on *Karenia brevis*

The effects of algicidal bacteria strains S03 and 41-DBG2, and the non-algicidal bacterium *A. latercula*, were examined on *K. brevis* isolates C2 (susceptible; Table 1) and NOAA-1 (resistant; Table 1). Cultures of *K. brevis* C2 inoculated with strain S03 or 41-DBG2 (both 10⁵ cells mL⁻¹) were lysed by Day 3 and Day 7, respectively (Fig. 3A). According to an ANOVA and an a posteriori Tukey’s HSD test, the response of cultures treated with either of the algicidal bacteria differed significantly from those receiving *A. latercula* (p = 0.0009). *K. mikimotoi* (G303ax-2). On Day 0 strain S03 was introduced into algal cultures at concentrations ranging from 10² to 10⁶ cells mL⁻¹ and *in vivo* fluorescence (mean ± 1 SE; n = 3) monitored over 4 days. A negative control received an equivalent volume of sterile seawater on Day 0.

**Fig. 1.** Effects of algicidal strain S03 inoculation density on growth of bacteria-free *K. mikimotoi* (G303ax-2). On Day 0 strain S03 was introduced into algal cultures at concentrations ranging from 10² to 10⁶ cells mL⁻¹ and *in vivo* fluorescence (mean ± 1 SE; n = 3) monitored over 4 days. A negative control received an equivalent volume of sterile seawater on Day 0.

**Fig. 2.** Growth of *Karenia* spp. in the presence of algicidal strain S03 and in *Karenia*S03 co-culture filtrates. On Day 0, strain S03 (■) was inoculated into cultures of *K. brevis* isolate C2 at 10⁵ cells mL⁻¹. An equivalent volume of sterile seawater was added to negative controls (■). *In vivo* fluorescence (mean ± 1 SE; n = 4) was monitored over 4 days. Immediately after algal cell lysis in S03 treatments (Day 4; note y-axis scale break), all *Karenia*S03 co-cultures were filtered (0.2 µm), filtrates were re-amended with f/2 nutrients, and bacteria-free *K. mikimotoi* (G303ax-2) cells were added (●). Negative control culture filtrates from Day 4 were treated identically (○). *In vivo* fluorescence (mean ± 1 SE; n = 2) was monitored over 10 days. Positive control filtrates receiving strain S03 were included (data not shown).
The interaction of algicidal bacteria strains S03 and 41-DBG2 with bacterial communities co-occurring in the non-axenic *K. brevis* isolates C2 and NOAA-1 were evaluated using denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (DGGE). Fewer bands, each representing at least one bacterial phylotype, were observed in *K. brevis* NOAA-1 cultures compared to those of the C2 isolate (Fig. 5). The band representing strain S03 was present throughout the time course in *K. brevis* C2 cultures amended with this bacterium. Maximum intensity of this band occurred on Day 3 (Fig. 5, upper left), coincident with a declining *in vivo* fluorescence (cf. Fig. 3A). In contrast, the most intense band representing strain S03 in *K. brevis* NOAA-1 cultures was on Day 0, immediately after being introduced into the diñoflagellate culture. Between Days 0 and 3, this band decreased in intensity until it became undetectable on Day 5.

DGGE analysis of *K. brevis* isolates C2 and NOAA-1 exposed to the strain 41-DBG2 displayed trends similar to those observed for the S03 experiments. In cultures of *K. brevis* C2 the band representing strain 41-DBG2 increased gradually in intensity, achieving a maximum coincident with culture lysis on Day 7 (cf. Fig. 3B). Unfortunately, insufficient amounts of DNA were obtained on Day 0 for analysis. In the resistant *K. brevis* NOAA-1 cultures (cf. Fig. 3B), the band representing strain 41-DBG2 was faintly apparent for the first 3 days (Fig. 5, lower right). On Days 5 and 7 insufficient amounts of DNA resulted in blank lanes for both time points.

4. Discussion

Here we report the isolation of a new algicidal bacterium from the eastern Gulf of Mexico, USA and a comparison of its activity with that of another algicidal strain originating from this region. Although both bacteria attack the red tide dinoflagellate, *K. brevis*, the dynamics of these interactions, and thus the efficacy of the killing process, clearly differ according to whether physical contact with target algal cells is required. Moreover, such differences in mode of attack may also influence the susceptibility of these bacteria to co-occurring antagonistic bacteria, which have been documented to adversely affect the growth and killing activity of algicidal strains (Roth et al., in press). These results add to our understanding of how algicidal bacteria interact not only with their target algal species, but also with the ambient microbial community, and further demonstrate the complex nature of these relationships.

16S rDNA sequence data placed algicidal strain S03 in the family Flavobacteriaceae, with its closest relatives being an unidentified marine bacterium and a member of the genus *Formosa* (both 98% maximum identity). The former was isolated from cultures of the non-toxic, bloom-forming dinoflagellate, *Scyphoselia trochoidea* (Hold et al., 2001), while the latter was isolated from surface and subsurface water samples in the Mediterranean Sea (Agougu et al., 2005). Nonetheless, given the sequence information available and phylogenetic analysis performed (data not shown), it was not possible to conclusively assign strain S03 to a genus at this time. The sequence similarity was also quite high (95%) between strain S03 and a previously described algicidal bacterium, *Flavobacterium* sp. (strain 5N-3; Fukami et al., 1992). However, unlike strain S03, which requires direct contact with its target algal cells, strain 5N-3 releases a small (<500 Da) algicidal compound into the surrounding medium...
(Fukami et al., 1992), more similar functionally to strain 41-DBG2, a Cytophaga sp. that also produces a dissolved, low molecular weight algicide (Twiner et al., 2004). The prior assignment of strain 41-DBG2 and several other algicidal bacteria to the genus Cytophaga may require re-evaluation, based in part on the recent reclassification of *C. latercula* to *A. latercula* (Nedashkovskaya et al., 2006). In addition, a number of new genera have been included in the CFB group (e.g., Yoon et al., 2005). The 16S rDNA sequence of strain 41-DBG2 is presently most similar (95%) to that of another algicidal marine bacterium within the family Flavobacteriaceae (strain LPK13) reported to be capable of inducing temporary cyst formation in the bloom-forming dinoflagellate *Lingulodinium polyedrum* (Mayali et al., 2007).

Most known algicidal bacteria are classified within either the CFB group or the Alteromonas–Pseudoalteromonas group (Yoshinaga et al., 1995; Kondo et al., 1999; Kitaguchi et al., 2001), with the former often more prevalent in both marine (median 18%; range 2–72%) and freshwater (median 7%; range 0–18%; Glöckner et al., 1999) bacterial communities. Given the frequent dominance of the CFB group and its inclusion of many known algicidal bacteria, it is likely that such bacteria will prove to be more abundant than previously thought. In fact, during this study we identified two spatio-temporally independent Gulf of Mexico samples that contained the algicidal strain S03. Interestingly, both were surface samples with non-detectable levels of *K. brevis*. This finding is consistent with an earlier conceptual model (Doucette et al., 1999) suggesting that algicidal bacteria are present in the ambient bacterial community at low concentrations during non-bloom conditions, which may allow them to respond rapidly to the appearance of *K. brevis* target cells during bloom initiation.

Algicidal strains S03 and 41-DBG2 exhibited identical specificities for the bacteria-containing *Karenia* isolates screened (when both strains were tested). Neither bacterium had an effect on *K. brevis* isolates C5 and NOAA-1 nor *K. mikimotoi* isolate NOAA-2, while only *K. brevis* C2 was susceptible to both strains. By swapping bacterial communities between susceptible and resistant *K. brevis* isolates, Mayali and Doucette (2002) demonstrated that resistance to algicidal attack was a function of the associated bacterial assemblage and not an intrinsic property of the dinoflagellate cells. Consistent with this argument, Long and Azam (2001) found that over half of the 86 bacterial isolates they examined exhibited some level of inhibitory activity against other bacteria and nine of these were antagonistic, each completely preventing growth of at least 10 other bacterial strains. Indeed, we recently isolated a member of the family Flavobacteriaceae from resistant *K. brevis* NOAA-1 cultures capable of reducing both the growth and algicidal activity of strain S03 in a concentration-dependent manner.

### Fig. 4. Photomicrographs of representative *K. brevis* (C2 and NOAA-1) cells exposed to algicidal bacteria strains S03 or 41-DBG2, or the negative control, *Aquimarina latercula*, at $10^5$ cells mL$^{-1}$ starting on Day 0. Cyst-like structures were observed on Day 7 in the *K. brevis* C2 cultures inoculated with either strain S03 or 41-DBG2 (photomicrographs to the right of time series).
Note that our DGGE data showed the rapid disappearance of algicidal bacteria phylotypes following inoculation into this same *K. brevis* isolate (NOAA-1) and no growth-inhibiting/morphological effects on the dinoflagellate were observed. Additionally, all bacteria-free *Karenia* cultures tested thus far (*K. brevis* isolates C2, NOAA-1; *K. mikimotoi* isolate G303ax-2) have been susceptible to lysis by known algicidal strains, further supporting the idea that a component(s) of the bacterial assemblage is involved in conferring resistance to algicidal attack.

A limited number of non-dinoflagellate taxa were screened for susceptibility to algicidal strains S03 and 41-DBG2. The one raphidophyte tested was resistant to both bacteria, whereas neither of the two diatoms examined showed resistance to algicidal attack; however, the small sample size precludes generalizing about the potential impact of these bacteria on a given algal group. None of the taxa resistant to algicidal attack, regardless of algal group, were bacteria-free. For dinoflagellates other than *Karenia* spp., two clonal cultures of *A. monilatum* (AM01, AM06) isolated from the same water sample (S. Morton, personal communication) and two *A. tamarense* isolates of different geographic origin were differentially susceptible to one of the algicidal bacteria. Such differences may reflect the association of bacteria “antagonistic” against an algicidal strain (e.g., Roth et al., in press) with resistant cultures at the time of their isolation.

The overall effectiveness of algicidal attack did not appear to be greatly influenced by whether or not contact with algal cells was required. Nonetheless, the mechanism of algicidal attack (direct versus indirect) did appear to modulate the temporal dynamics of interactions with target cells. *K. brevis* C2 cultures treated with strain S03 (direct attack) began to decline (*in vivo*).
fluorescence) immediately following exposure, with photomicrographs revealing rounded cells within a day or two of exposure and complete cell lysis shortly thereafter (by Day 5). Culture death also coincided with the presence of a predominant S03 phylotype (band) in the DGGE analysis. Introduction of strain 41-DBG2 (indirect attack) to cultures of this same *K. brevis* isolate caused growth suppression throughout the time course, corresponding to less severe cell rounding, with lysis not occurring until Day 7, which also matched well with the timing of maximum band intensity for the 41-DBG2 phylotype. Members of the CFB complex are known degraders of biomacromolecules such as cellulose (Reichenbach and Dworkin, 1991), a key structural component of dinoflagellate cell walls, which may explain the rapid loss of cell integrity observed with strain S03. Alternatively, the activity of a dissolved algicide released into the growth medium would be diffusion-limited, which could lead to a more protracted killing of an algal culture as was noted for strain 41-DBG2. The exact nature of these dissolved algidial compounds, and thus their mechanism of action, has yet to be elucidated (reviewed by Skerratt et al., 2002; Twiner et al., 2004), although previous workers have proposed the involvement of ectoproteases (Mitsutani et al., 2001; Lee et al., 2000).

A particularly interesting observation made during this study was the consistent presence of a small number of cyst-like cells later in the time course, but only in those cultures treated with algidial bacteria. A true resting cyst, generally considered to be the product of gametic fusion in dinoflagellates, has yet to be described for *K. brevis*. Nonetheless, given the circumstances under which these cyst-like structures occurred (i.e., exposure to algidial bacteria), it is likely that they are analogous to asexual temporary or ecydial cysts documented previously for other dinoflagellates and considered to be induced by some type of physico-chemical, or possibly biologically mediated, stress (see Steidinger and Garceş, 2006). As noted above, strain LPK13 (*Flavobacteriaceae*), an algidial bacterium showing the highest sequence similarity (95%) to strain 41-DBG2, is also capable of inducing temporary cyst formation in a dinoflagellate (*L. polyedrum*), which is proposed as a mechanism to eliminate attached, potentially harmful bacteria (Mayali et al., 2007). Scanning electron microscopy as well as germination studies will be needed to better characterize the morphology and assess the viability of the putative *K. brevis* temporary cysts.

To conclude, numerous algidial bacteria have been identified both in freshwater and marine ecosystems. Nonetheless, continued exploration of how they interact with both their algal target species, as well as the ambient microbial community, is necessary to determine what role, if any, these bacteria play in regulating the growth and termination of HABs. Composition of the microbial community appears to be a key factor influencing the killing activity of certain algidial strains in cultures of *K. brevis* and this is likely to be the case in natural bloom populations. Moreover, a recent laboratory study of brevetoxin dynamics following attack of *K. brevis* cells by algidial bacteria has revealed marked changes in the both the size-fractioned distribution of the toxin, accompanied by a decline in overall toxicity (Roth et al., 2007). Although a difficult task, it will be essential to evaluate the potential outcomes of these complex interactions in field-based studies (e.g., mesocosms) when assessing the potential role of algidial bacteria not only as natural regulators of bloom dynamics, but as part of a HAB management and control strategy.

Acknowledgments

The authors wish to thank Drs. K. Fukami, K. Steidinger, and S. Morton for kindly providing *Karenia* cultures used in this work. Support for this research was provided by the US ECOHAB Program sponsored by NOAA, the US EPA, NSF, NASA, and ONR, and by NOAA/NOS operational funds. This is contribution number 263 from the US ECOHAB Program.

Disclaimer. This publication does not constitute an endorsement of any commercial product or intend to be an opinion beyond scientific or other results obtained by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA). No reference shall be made to NOAA, or this publication furnished by NOAA, to any advertising or sales promotion which would indicate or imply that NOAA recommends or endorses any proprietary product mentioned herein, or which has as its purpose an interest to cause the advertised product to be used or purchased because of this publication.[SS]

References


